

A CASE OF MISTAKEN IDENTITY, OR
THE MYSTERIOUS C. E. LLOYD

IRVING W. KNOBLOCH

One of the most interesting travelogues dealing with the natural history of the New World is "Unknown Mexico", a two volume work by Carl Lumholtz (1902). In this account will be found those discoveries noted by him on a series of expeditions mostly in western Mexico during the years 1890 to 1898, a span of time interrupted from time to time for the purpose of raising money for further exploration.

About one and a half years were spent by members of the expedition among the unique Tarahumare Indians of Chihuahua, a group of cave-dwellers. Incidentally, Carl Lumholtz was born at Faberg, Norway in 1851 and died at Saranac Lake, New York on May 5, 1922.

In this offering we are only concerned with the first Lumholtz Expedition. From reading "Unknown Mexico" one gathers the impression that this lasted from 1890 to 1893 but others believe that the dates were 1890 to 1892. For example, J. A. Allen (1893) published a list of mammals and birds collected in northeastern Sonora and northwestern Chihuahua, Mexico on the Lumholtz Archaeological Expedition, 1890-1892. It is difficult to see how this article could have gotten into print in 1893 if the expedition did not end sometime in 1892.

According to Allen, the first expedition left Bisbee, Arizona in September 1890. It traveled 225 miles south to Bacadehuachy and Nacory on the Río Yaqui, passing San Pedro (32 miles south of Bisbee), Los Trincheras, Santa Barbera, Fronteras, Cachuta (102 miles south of Bisbee), Los Trinitas (127 miles south of Bisbee), Los Pinitos, Los Cuevas, Oputo, Granados, Bacadehuachyl (the last three on the Río Yaqui), thence eastward toward and across the Sierra Madre, passing the following — Nacory (3400 ft.), Heurachi (4000 ft.), Napolera, El Puerto (6300 ft.) Bavispe River, Rancho de Los Apaches (6620 ft.), Chuhua-chupa, Tachico (2000 ft.) to San Diego (4000 ft.) on the eastern slope. From February 15th to March 1st trips were

made from San Diego to Guanopa, Río Chico and Tatuara. This itinerary evidently only encompasses the immediate time span during which F. Robinette of Washington, D.C. and A. D. Meeds of Minneapolis, Minnesota collected mammals and birds. It should be mentioned that the personnel of the expeditions changed often and that as many as thirty men were involved with the various Lumholtz expeditions.

Of course, botanists also accompanied Lumholtz. Several years ago, in doing the biography of all collectors of plants in northern Mexico (unpubl.), we became aware that the names of two botanists, C. E. Lloyd and C. V. Hartman were printed on several hundred (?) labels in various herbaria, as being the collectors of plants on the first Lumholtz expedition.

No problem presented itself in the case of Carl Vilhelm Hartman who was born in Orebro, Sweden on August 19, 1862 and who died in Stockholm, Sweden on June 19, 1941. We will pass over his illustrious history because it is not germane to our thesis. When we came to the collection of data on C. E. Lloyd, we located absolutely nothing regarding his background. The only major clue we found attesting to his existence is the printed herbarium labels, prepared at Harvard University by B. L. Robinson and M. L. Fernald. We frequently did encounter the name "Francis E. Lloyd." The latter, an eminent botanist, led a life which, in part, is difficult to put down upon an accurate time table. He was born in 1868 in England and entered Princeton University in 1889 as a junior, presumably having attended Lafayette College before this event. He terminated his undergraduate work at Princeton with graduation in 1891. Certain plant collections by him on the Lumholtz expedition are dated "1890", and it is possible, therefore, that he went to Mexico while still an undergraduate. This matter will be dealt with in more detail later. Lloyd was appointed a Fellow at Princeton 1891-2 but resigned presumably to take a position as assistant professor at Williams College. In 1895 he received an A.M. degree from Princeton. This year coincides with his tenure at Pacific University (1892 to 1897) but his A.M. degree may have been conferred *in*

absentia. Another overlap is found in the dates 1896 to 1906 when he was associated with the Teachers College at Columbia University. Lloyd received honorary Doctor of Science degrees from University of Wales and from the University of Masaryk. After 1906, his other employers were the Desert Laboratory of Carnegie Institute, the Continental Mexican Rubber Company, Alabama Polytechnic Institute and, lastly, McGill University in Canada. The above information was gleaned from various sources (Ridge 1968, Gibbs 1968, Scarth 1948, Wulf 1967, Thomas 1967, Mason 1958, Tryon 1959, Norwegian Embassy 1958, Schwarten 1959, Rollins 1958).

At this point, it seemed obvious to us that we had to choose between C. E. Lloyd and F. E. Lloyd. Accordingly we set down the following facts both pro and con.

Pro C. E. Lloyd

As stated above, the herbarium labels of the first expedition include a "C. E. Lloyd".

In the Preface to volume 1, page X of "Unknown Mexico" by Carl Lumholtz (1902), we find the statement "Messrs. C. V. Hartman and C. E. Lloyd were the botanists,".

A research article by B. L. Robinson and M. L. Fernald (1895) is entitled "New Plants Collected by Messrs. C. V. Hartman and C. E. Lloyd upon an archaeological expedition to northwestern Mexico under the direction of Dr. Carl Lumholtz".

One of F. E. Lloyd's closest friends was C. E. Bradley, research associate in chemistry at California Institute of Technology. Bradley correctly pointed out that F. E. Lloyd taught at Pacific University, Forest Grove, Oregon from 1892 to 1897. He does not believe that Lloyd went to Mexico until 1907. Since the first Lumholtz expedition was from 1890 to 1892, it would appear that either Francis E. Lloyd did *not* go on the trip, or, he left the expedition early to take the position at Pacific University in 1892.

Pro F. E. Lloyd

Paul Standley (1920) mentioned the name of F. E. Lloyd as being on the Lumholtz expedition.

The first Lumholtz trip was from 1890 to 1892. Dr. Francis E. Lloyd, having been born in 1868, was 22 years old at the time of the expedition and thus could very well have been on the trip.

Both the Barnhart File at the New York Botanical Garden and American Men of Science, 1944, indicate that F. E. Lloyd was on the Lumholtz expedition.

Dr. F. Shreve and Dr. F. E. Lloyd were well-known to each other, both having been on the staff of the Desert Laboratory in Arizona. In the Foreword to Dr. Howard Gentry's "Rio Mayo Plants" (1942), Dr. Shreve mentioned that C. V. Hartman and F. E. Lloyd accompanied Dr. Lumholtz on his 1890 expedition, an endorsement which can hardly be in error.

In M. L. Fernald's "Synopsis of the Mexican and Central American Species of *Alnus*" (1904) we note that *Alnus oblongifolia* Torr. was collected at Huehuerachi, Sonora at an altitude of 1230 meters in December 1890 by C. V. Hartman (no. 322) and by F. E. Lloyd (no. 464). In the same year F. E. Lloyd collected *Salvia elegans sonoriensis* at Rinconardo, Sonora, twenty-one days after Hartman collected the same taxon at Huehuerachi, Sonora (M. L. Fernald 1900).

Notholaena lumholtzii was collected by Hartman, number 298 (GH, US) on the Lumholtz expedition and is the type. Dr. F. E. Lloyd evidently collected the same species (no. 489) on the same trip. This specimen is also at the Gray Herbarium.

Dr. Carl Lumholtz (1891) himself mentioned Francis E. Lloyd as one of his collectors on page 389 of "Report on Explorations in Northern Mexico". This contradicts what he wrote in "Unknown Mexico" in 1902 but can be attributed to an excusable *lapsus mentis*.

When all the evidence given above is evaluated, it would seem logical to assume that one of the botanists on the first Lumholtz expedition was Francis E. Lloyd and not the mysterious "C. E. Lloyd". Since Francis E. Lloyd did not graduate from Princeton until 1891, and since some of his collections were dated 1890, we shall be forced to conclude

that Lloyd was still an undergraduate at the time of his participation in the Lumholtz adventure.

DEPARTMENT OF BOTANY AND PLANT PATHOLOGY
MICHIGAN STATE UNIVERSITY, LANSING

LITERATURE CITED

- ALLEN, J. A. 1893. List of Mammals and Birds Collected in Northwestern Sonora and Northwestern Chihuahua, Mexico, on the Lumholtz Archaeological Expedition, 1890-1892.
- FERNALD, M. L. 1900. A Synopsis of the Mexican and Central American Species of *Salvia*. Proc. Amer. Acad. Arts and Sci. **35**: 489-556.
- . 1904. Synopsis of the Mexican and Central American Species of *Alnus*. Proc. Amer. Acad. Arts and Sci. **40**: 24-28.
- GENTRY, H. S. 1942. Rio Mayo Plants. Carnegie Institution of Washington, Publ. 527.
- GIBBS, R. D. 1968. (Pers. Com.)
- LUMHOLTZ, C. 1891. Report of Explorations in Northern Mexico. Jour. Amer. Geo. Soc. N.Y. **23**: 386-402.
- . 1902. Unknown Mexico. N.Y. Charles Scribner's Sons. 2 vols.
- MASON, C.T. 1958. (Pers. Com.)
- NORWEGIAN EMBASSY 1958. (Pers. Com.)
- RIDGE, A. D. 1968. (Pers. Com.)
- ROBINSON, B. L. and FERNALD, M. L. 1895. New Plants Collected by Messrs. C. V. Hartman and C. E. Lloyd upon an Archaeological Expedition to Northwestern Mexico under the Direction of Dr. Carl Lumholtz. Proc. Amer. Acad. Arts and Sci. **30**: 114-123.
- ROLLINS, R. C. 1958. (Pers. Com.)
- SCARTH, G. W. 1948. In *Memoriam*, Francis Ernest Lloyd, 1868-1947. Plant Physiology **23** (1): 1-4.
- . 1948. Francis E. Lloyd. Proc. & Trans. Roy. Soc. Canada, 3rd Ser., **42**: 99-102.
- SCHWARTEN, LAZELLA 1959. (Pers. Com.)
- STANDLEY, P. C. 1920. Trees and Shrubs of Mexico. Contr. U.S. Nat. Herb. **23**(1): 140, footnote.
- THOMAS, M. H. 1967. (Pers. Com.)
- TRYON, R. 1959. (Pers. Com.)
- WULF, GLORIA 1967. (Pers. Com.)